

## **EDUCATION, CULTURE AND SPORT COMMITTEE**

ABERDEEN, 7 February 2013 – minute of meeting of the EDUCATION, CULTURE AND SPORT COMMITTEE. Present: Councillor Laing (Convener); Councillor Thomson (Vice Convener); and Councillors Boulton, Cameron, Carle, Cooney, Crockett (up until and including Kincorth ASG and then from St Machar ASG), Jackie Dunbar (as substitute for Councillor McCaig), Lesley Dunbar, Malik, May, Jean Morrison (as substitute for Councillor Crockett from Northfield ASG up until and including Oldmachar ASG) Noble, Samarai, Stewart, Stuart, Taylor, Townson, Young and Yuill (as substitute for Councillor Greig); and Mr S Duncan (Teacher representative - primary schools), Mr M Maclean (Parent representative – secondary schools), Reverend E McKenna (Church of Scotland representative), Mr A Nicoll (Parent representative – primary schools and ASN), Mr M Paul (Teacher representative – secondary schools), and Mrs I Wischik (Roman Catholic religious representative).

**The agenda and reports associated with this minute can be located at the following link:**

<http://committees.aberdeencity.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=143&MId=2782&Ver=4>

### **WELCOME**

1. The Convener welcomed members of the public to the meeting, and advised that six students were also in attendance as part of their course in Public Administration at the University of Aberdeen. They were all studying towards a Diploma in Legal Practice. The Convener wished them well in their course.

### **REQUESTS FOR DEPUTATION**

2. The Committee had before it two requests for deputation in relation to the report to be considered on this day, as follows –

- Middleton Park Parent Council
- St Peter's RC Primary Friends' Association (Parents' Council).

The Convener proposed that the deputations be considered at the appropriate point in the meeting (ie the Middleton Park Parent Council deputation would be heard immediately prior to consideration of the Oldmachar Associated School Group (ASG), and the St Peter's RC Primary Friends' Association (Parents' Council) deputation would be heard immediately prior to consideration of the denominational (Roman Catholic) ASG).

### **The Committee resolved:**

to concur with the Convener's proposals.

## **NURSERY/ PRIMARY SCHOOL ESTATE REVIEW**

**3.** With reference to article 11 of the minute of its previous meeting of 31 January 2013, the Committee had before it a report by the Director of Education, Culture and Sport which presented a series of recommendations on the future provision of nursery and primary school education across Aberdeen. The report advised that this was intended to provide clear direction and vision for educational provision for the next twenty to twenty five years by taking account of significant educational change, demographics and the recently adopted Local Development Plan. Members noted that the report had been reissued in order to provide clarity in relation to two of the maps included in the papers, and some of the associated text.

The Convener took the opportunity to thank officers for the extensive engagement exercise they had undertaken, and continued that she felt that this had enriched the paper. She thanked officers involved in the process for all of their work on the review over the past months.

**The report recommended –**  
that the Committee –

- (a) notes the comments contained in the submissions from stakeholders during the recent informal engagement process on the nursery/primary school estate, and technical information on various aspects of the existing nursery and primary school estate;
- (b) accepts recommendations 1 to 58 as set out in the report, which include indicative cost implications and proposed timescales for implementation;
- (c) agrees the principles for future management of nursery and primary educational provision in recommendations 59 to 64 as set out in the report; and
- (d) instructs officers to facilitate the next steps in progressing accepted recommendations, including where necessary, statutory consultation.

**The Convener proposed that the report before members be considered in sections (set out in Associated School Groups (ASGs)), rather than as one set of recommendations. Members concurred with the Convener in this regard, and so considered recommendation (a) above at this point, then continued to consider each ASG in turn, and finally considering recommendations (c) and (d) above as the final items of business.**

**In relation to recommendation (a) above, the Committee resolved:**  
to approve the recommendation.

## Aberdeen Grammar ASG

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved:  
that the Committee accept the recommendations for Aberdeen Grammar ASG as detailed in the report, as follows –

Ashley Road	(1) Include in Victorian schools programme.
	(2) No change to secondary zoning arrangements.
Gilcomstoun	(3) Include in Victorian schools programme.
	(4) Retain Gaelic provision.
Mile End	(5) Rezone Foresterhill Hospital complex area from Mile End to Cornhill PS, as per map R5.
Skene Square	(6) Include in Victorian schools programme.

Councillor Townson, seconded by Councillor Cameron, moved as an amendment – that in relation to recommendations (1) – (6), that further to the information already presented and prior to any formal consultation process, the Committee instructs that a report including detailed information on current rolls and projected rolls for the next three years, capacity and occupancy rates, the out of zone admission policy, percentages of out of zone pupils showing relative percentages from Aberdeen city and Aberdeenshire, education attainment levels, locations of proposed schools, traffic implications, condition of buildings, projected costs and full financial modelling, be brought to the meeting of this Committee of 28 March 2013.

On a division, the votes cast were as follows: for the motion (18) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, and Councillors Boulton, Carle, Cooney, Crockett, Lesley Dunbar, Malik, Jennifer Stewart, Taylor, Young and Yuill, and Mr Duncan, Mr Maclean, Reverend McKenna, Mr Nicoll, Mr Paul and Mrs Wischik; for the amendment (7) – Councillors Cameron, Jackie Dunbar, May, Noble, Samarai, Stuart and Townson.

### **The Committee resolved:**

- (i) to adopt the successful motion; and
- (ii) to note that the Head of Schools and Educational Establishments would be reporting to a future meeting of this Committee on Gaelic provision in the city.

## Bridge of Don ASG

### **The Committee resolved:**

Braehead	to accept recommendation (7), to rezone Grandholm Village from Braehead to Danestone and from Bridge of Don Academy to Oldmachar Academy as per map R7.
Scotstown	to accept recommendation (8) to rezone northern area of zone from Scotstown to Greenbrae and from Bridge of Don Academy to Oldmachar Academy as per map R8 below.

## Bucksburn ASG

### **The Committee resolved:**

Bucksburn	to accept recommendation (9) to rezone part of current Bucksburn zone between trunk road north to River Don and current Newhills zone north of trunk road to new provision - see Stoneywood recommendation (9) below.
	to accept recommendation(10) to create new zone by rezoning part of current Bucksburn zone to north of River Don to new zone(s) in Grandhome Estate, as per map R10 below.
	to accept recommendation (11) for the creation of new school (with Newhills primary school) and to note that this project underway.
Kingswells	to accept recommendation (12) to establish new secondary zone in Countesswells area as per Map R12.
Newhills	to accept the recommendation (11) for the creation of new school (with Bucksburn primary school) and to note that this project underway.
Stoneywood	to accept the recommendation (9) to establish new school to include Stoneywood (possibly on former Bankhead Academy site), as per map R9.
	to accept recommendation (13) to rezone part of existing Stoneywood catchment including former BP HQ to Dyce, as per map R13.

## Cults ASG

### **The Committee resolved:**

Culter	to accept recommendation (14) to include in Victorian schools programme.
Cults	to accept recommendation (15) that all pupils from Countesswells development to be initially educated at Braeside School and Hazlehead Academy whilst new Primary and Secondary Schools are built; to rezone remote part of zone to create new zone in Countesswells development and build new school as per map R15.
	to accept recommendation (16) to create new delineated area within Countesswells development to include part of existing Cults primary school zone (in addition to the separated zone of Airyhall, see below) to accommodate all pupils from Countesswells development; this will require two new build primary schools and one academy. See map R16.
Milltimber	to accept recommendation (17) for a new build school on Oldfold site, to accommodate all existing pupils and those from new development.
	to accept recommendation (18) - disposal of existing school site.
	to instruct officers to advise Aberdeenshire Council that the new Blairs Development of 280 houses plus a potential further 44 will not be zoned to Cults Academy.

## Dyce ASG

### **The Committee resolved:**

Dyce	to accept recommendation (13) to rezone new housing on former BP HQ from Stoneywood to Dyce, as per map R13.
	to accept recommendation (19) to investigate use of excess space at Dyce primary school by other services.

## Harlaw ASG

### **The Committee resolved:**

Broomhill	to accept recommendation (20) to include in the Victorian schools programme.
	to accept recommendation (21) to rezone dual zoned area between Broomhill and Airyhall to Airyhall only, as per map R21.
	to accept recommendation (22) to rezone dual zoned area between Broomhill and Ferryhill to Broomhill only , as per map R22.
	to accept recommendation (23) to create additional nursery class.
Ferryhill	to accept recommendation (24) to include in Victorian schools programme.
	to accept recommendation (22) to rezone dual zoned area between Broomhill and Ferryhill to Broomhill only, as per map R22.
Kaimhill	to accept recommendation (25) that no change be made to provision.
	to instruct officers to carry out statutory consultation regarding the rezoning of Hanover Street Primary School from St Machar Academy to Harlaw Academy.

## Hazlehead ASG

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved:

that the Committee accept recommendations for Hazlehead ASG as detailed in the report, as follows –

Airyhall	(15) Rezone remote part of zone to create new zone in Countesswells development and build new school – as per map R15; all pupils from Countesswells development to be initially educated at Braeside School and Hazlehead Academy whilst new primary and secondary schools are built.
	(16) Create new delineated area within Countesswells development to include the separated zone of Airyhall and part of existing Cults primary school zone to accommodate all pupils from Countesswells development; this will require two new build primary schools and one academy (as per map R16 ).
	(21) Rezone dual zoned area between Broomhill and Airyhall to Airyhall only, and rezone Macaulay Estate housing from Hazlehead to Airyhall as per map R21.
Fernielea	(26) rezone dual zoned area between Fernielea and Hazlehead PS to Hazlehead only, as per map R26.

	(27) Extend and enhance provision to accommodate development at Maidenraig South.
Hazlehead	(21) Rezone Macaulay Estate housing from Hazlehead to Airyhall. (26) Rezone dual zoned area between Hazlehead and Fernielea to Hazlehead only as per map R26.
Kingsford	(28) Extend and enhance provision to accommodate development at Maidenraig North.

Councillor Yuill, seconded by Councillor Stewart, moved as an amendment – that the Committee approve the recommendations for the Hazlehead ASG (as above) and instruct officers to investigate the feasibility of providing a new primary school in the Maidenraig area, and to report back on that, and what a suitable catchment area for such a school would be.

On a division, the votes cast were as follows: for the motion (23) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, and Councillors Boulton, Cameron, Carle, Cooney, Crockett, Jackie Dunbar, Lesley Dunbar, Malik, May, Noble, Samarai, Stuart, Taylor, Townson and Young, and Mr Duncan, Mr Maclean, Reverend McKenna, Mr Nicoll, Mr Paul and Mrs Wischik; for the amendment (2) – Councillors Jennifer Stewart and Yuill.

**The Committee resolved:**

to adopt the successful motion.

Kincorth ASG

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved: that the Committee accept the recommendations for Kincorth ASG as detailed in the report, as follows –

Abbotswell	(29) Amalgamate Abbotswell and Kirkhill Schools to create new school on site to be identified.
Charleston	(30) Create new zone by amending Charleston zone to create accommodate pupils from new developments at Cove in new build school as per map R30.
Kirkhill	(31) Amalgamate Kirkhill and Abbotswell Schools to create new school on site to be identified.
	(32) Amend Kirkhill zone to contribute to zone for new school in Loirston/Cove development as per map R30.
	(33) Rezone area of Kirkhill zone east of trunk road to Loirston as per map R30.
Loirston	(34) Amend Loirston zone to contribute to zone for new school in Loirston/Cove development as per map R30.
	(33) Rezone area of Kirkhill zone east of trunk road to Loirston as per map R30.

Councillor Townson, seconded by Councillor Cameron, moved as an amendment – that in relation to the recommendations for Kincorth ASG, that further to the information already presented and prior to any formal consultation process, the Committee instructs that a report including detailed information on current rolls and projected rolls for the next three years, capacity and occupancy rates, the out of zone admission policy, percentages of out of

zone pupils showing relative percentages from Aberdeen city and Aberdeenshire, education attainment levels, locations of proposed schools, traffic implications, condition of buildings, projected costs and full financial modelling, be brought to the meeting of this Committee of 28 March 2013.

On a division, the votes cast were as follows: for the motion (18) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, and Councillors Boulton, Carle, Cooney, Crockett, Lesley Dunbar, Malik, Jennifer Stewart, Taylor, Young and Yuill, and Mr Duncan, Mr Maclean, Reverend McKenna, Mr Nicoll, Mr Paul and Mrs Wischik; for the amendment (7) – Councillors Cameron, Jackie Dunbar, May, Noble, Samarai, Stuart and Townson.

**The Committee resolved:**

to adopt the successful motion.

**Northfield ASG**

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved:

that the Committee accept the recommendations for Northfield ASG as detailed in the report, as follows –

Bramble Brae	(35) Amalgamate Bramble Brae and Quarryhill to create new school on Quarryhill site.
	(36) Remove secondary dual zoning with St Machar and zone only to Northfield Academy as per map R36.
Heathryburn	(37) No change to provision.
Manor Park	(38) Remove secondary dual zoning with St Machar and zone only to Northfield Academy as per map R36.
Muirfield	(39) No change to provision.
Quarryhill	(35) Amalgamate Quarryhill and Bramble Brae to create new school on Quarryhill site.
Westpark	(40) No change to provision.

Councillor Townson, seconded by Councillor Jackie Dunbar, moved as an amendment –

that in relation to the recommendations for Northfield ASG, that further to the information already presented and prior to any formal consultation process, the Committee instructs that a report including detailed information on current rolls and projected rolls for the next three years, capacity and occupancy rates, the out of zone admission policy, percentages of out of zone pupils showing relative percentages from Aberdeen city and Aberdeenshire, education attainment levels, locations of proposed schools, traffic implications, condition of buildings, projected costs and full financial modelling, be brought to the meeting of this Committee of 28 March 2013.

On a division, the votes cast were as follows: for the motion (18) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, and Councillors Boulton, Carle, Cooney, Lesley Dunbar, Malik, Jean Morrison, Jennifer Stewart, Taylor, Young and Yuill, and Mr Duncan, Mr Maclean, Reverend McKenna, Mr Nicoll, Mr Paul and Mrs Wischik; for the amendment (7) – Councillors Cameron, Jackie Dunbar, May, Noble, Samarai, Stuart and Townson.

**The Committee resolved:**  
to adopt the successful motion.

Oldmachar ASG

With reference to the decision taken at article 2 of this minute, the Committee heard Victoria Moore (Chair – Middleton Park Parent Council), Ewan Paterson and John Thomson (both of Middleton Park Parent Council), who expressed a number of concerns in relation to the proposal to merge Middleton Park and Glashieburn primary schools.

Members asked a number of questions of the deputation and of officers, and the Convener thanked Ms Moore, Mr Paterson and Mr Thomson for their contribution.

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved:  
that the Committee accept the recommendations for Oldmachar ASG as detailed in the report, as follows –

Danestone	(7) Rezone Grandholm Village from Braehead to Danestone and from Bridge of Don Academy to Oldmachar Academy as per map R7.
	(41) Prepare for pupils from first phase of Grandhome Estate development, using spare capacity until first new school is built at Grandhome Estate.
Forehill	(42) No proposals.
Glashieburn	(43) Create new school by amalgamation with Middleton Park on Glashieburn site.
Greenbrae	(8) Rezone northern area of zone from Scotstown to Greenbrae and from Bridge of Don Academy to Oldmachar Academy as per map R8.
	(44) Extend to increase capacity to accommodate rezoned pupils from Scotstown zone (including from new Dubford development) and improve suitability.
Middleton Park	(43) Create new school by amalgamation with Middleton Park on Glashieburn site.
	(45) Rezone part of current Middleton Park zone to new zone(s) in Grandhome Estate as per map R45.

Councillor Townson, seconded by Councillor Cameron, moved as an amendment – that in relation to the recommendations for Oldmachar ASG, that further to the information already presented and prior to any formal consultation process, the Committee instructs that a report including detailed information on current rolls and projected rolls for the next three years, capacity and occupancy rates, the out of zone admission policy, percentages of out of zone pupils showing relative percentages from Aberdeen city and Aberdeenshire, education attainment levels, locations of proposed schools, traffic implications, condition of buildings, projected costs and full financial modelling, be brought to the meeting of this Committee of 28 March 2013.

On a division, the votes cast were as follows: for the motion (15) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, and Councillors Boulton, Carle, Cooney, Lesley Dunbar, Malik, Jean Morrison, Taylor and Young, and Mr Duncan, Mr Maclean, Reverend



McKenna, Mr Nicoll and Mr Paul; for the amendment (10) – Councillors Cameron, Jackie Dunbar, May, Noble, Samarai, Jennifer Stewart, Stuart, Townson and Yuill and Mrs Wischik.

**The Committee resolved:**

to adopt the successful motion.

St Machar ASG

**The Committee resolved:**

Bramble Brae	to accept recommendation (35) to amalgamate Bramble Brae and Quarryhill to create new school on Quarryhill site.
	to accept recommendation (36) to remove secondary dual zoning with St Machar and zone only to Northfield Academy as per map R36.
Cornhill	to accept recommendation (5) to rezone Foresterhill Hospital complex area from Mile End to Cornhill PS, as per map R5 below.
Hanover St	to accept the recommendation (46) to remove dual zoning between Hanover St and Sunnybank to Sunnybank only as per Map 46.
Kittybrewster	to accept recommendation (47) to include in Victorian schools programme.
Manor Park	to accept recommendation (38) to remove secondary dual zoning with St Machar and zone only to Northfield Academy as per map R38.
Riverbank	to accept recommendation (48) to note the approved extension (phase one of site redevelopment).
	to accept recommendation (49) to continue to redevelop remainder of site as funding becomes available.
Seaton	to accept recommendation (50) to extend educational provision within existing accommodation to provide additional class(es).
Sunnybank	to accept recommendation (51) to include in Victorian schools programme.
	to accept recommendation (46) to remove dual zoning between Hanover St and Sunnybank to Sunnybank only as per map 46.
Woodside	to accept recommendation (52) to include in Victorian Schools programme.
	to instruct officers to carry out statutory consultation regarding the rezoning of Hanover Street Primary School from St Machar Academy to Harlaw Academy.

Torry ASG

**The Committee resolved:**

Tullos	(53) to accept the recommendation to include in Suitability and Condition Improvement Programme.	to accept the recommendation
	(54) to accept the recommendation to rezone former Victoria Road Zone between Tullos and Walker Road, as per map R54.	to accept the recommendation

Walker Road	(55) to accept the recommendation to include in Victorian schools programme.	to accept the recommendation
	(54) to accept the recommendation to zone former Victoria Road zone between Tullos and Walker Road, as per map R54.	to accept the recommendation

Denominational (Roman Catholic) ASG

With reference to the decision taken at article 2 of this minute, the Committee heard Louise McGettigan and Dr Janet Stewart of St Peter's Roman Catholic (RC) Primary Friends' Association (Parents' Council) who expressed concern that the report did not appear to address adequately the ongoing acute challenges that St Peter's faced due to the school being both over capacity and oversubscribed. They were particularly concerned that the time frame for the additional consultation proposed for denominational schools (September to December 2013) would do nothing to alleviate the problems that St Peter's would face with the August 2013 intake. In particular, they requested that the Committee (1) begin consultation immediately; (2) request officers to include all suggestions for the future of St Peter's RC Primary that had been put forward by parents and the school; and (3) demand a response in relation to capacity for 2013 at the earliest possible date.

Members asked a number of questions of the deputation and of officers; in particular the Head of Educational Development, Policy and Performance addressed the issues raised in the deputation.

The Convener thanked Ms McGettigan and Dr Stewart for their contribution.

**The Committee resolved:**

Holy Family	to accept recommendation (56) to review of provision as a separate exercise and report back to future Committee.
St Josephs	
St Peters	

Remaining recommendations (no ASG)

**The Committee resolved:**

- (i) to accept recommendation (57), to retain French School on Aberdeen Grammar School Campus, under current lease arrangements; and to retain provision when lease is renewed; and
- (ii) to accept recommendation (58), to carry out a review of provision at Cordyce School and develop a fully costed evaluation of replacement provision, once findings of review of inclusion has reported.

**In relation to recommendations (c) and (d) in the report, the Committee resolved:**

- (i) to agree the principles presented below:
 

(59) new or replacement school would be designed to accommodate fewer than two or more than three streams of pupils (i.e. classes at each stage - P1, P2 etc).
--

(60) Nursery provision should be incorporated into all primary schools, where appropriate and requirements of Scottish Government legislation under Children's Services Bill, if enacted, are implemented as soon as practicable.

(61) A re-evaluation of primary school capacities should be implemented to take account of changes in local and national government policies on maximum class sizes; in particular, where a maximum class size of 18 in primary 1 and 25 in composite classes reduces the functional capacity on a year by year basis determined by class configurations, an annual working capacity will be formulated; this will result in an overall theoretical capacity for each school, as well as a capacity figure which reflects the school's class configuration; this may vary year on year, depending on the number of children in each year group and hence, the number of classes at each stage, including composite classes.

(62) Where appropriate, roll capping in primary schools should be considered; this may have implications for out of zone placing requests.

(63) Instigation of a programme to improve external play and learning opportunities in all schools.

(64) Ongoing engagement with Learning and Leisure of Aberdeenshire Council should be enhanced so that mutual understanding of likely policy decisions is developed at an early stage.

- (ii) to approve the principle of recommendation (60) with a slight amendment as follows (amendment in bold) "Nursery provision should be incorporated into all primary schools, where **possible** and requirements of Scottish Government legislation under Children's Services Bill, if enacted, are implemented as soon as practicable"; and
- (iii) to instruct officers to facilitate the next steps in progressing accepted recommendations, including where necessary, statutory consultation.

Councillor Stewart took the opportunity at the close of the meeting to thank officers for their assistance, and stated that she felt that her Group had been listened to throughout the engagement exercise.

- **JENNIFER LAING; Convener**