



Qualitative Appraisal

The Qualitative and Quantitative Appraisal

Where we cannot quantify benefits in economic terms, we have undertaken a qualitative appraisal to sit alongside. The appraisal looks at the wider economic benefit of each option, supporting the development of understanding the ratio between economic plus non-economic benefit against costs. This appraisal supports the process in which a decision can be made.

RAAC affected homes, Balnagask

Homes in the Balnagask Area were built in the 1960s (over 60 years old). At the time, they were built with RAAC in the roof panels. RAAC would have most likely been used due to it being seen to be cost effective. Today, several homes have repair issues including damp and mould. Such repair issues are exacerbated by the fact that several homes have signs of water ingress as a result of RAAC defects.

Recent housing stock condition surveys of 10 long-term VOID properties show ceilings have been affected by water ingress, resulting in variations of damp and mould. Flooring was noted as being in poor condition across several properties which had potential to set serious risk of imminent failure. Roofing, external walls and flooring exhibited major defects and not operating as intended, requiring attention in the short term, although not immediate.

Torry Community

The area of Torry, where Balnagask is located, is ranked the most deprived area (20%), and parts of Torry East ranked as the most deprived area (10%) across income, employment, education/skills and housing, crime, and Geographic Access (Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation, 2020). In addition, 1 in 3 adults in Torry have no formal qualification (Our Place Our Priorities Torry, 2016). In Balnagask, 30% of the population are income deprived (Our Place Our Priorities Torry, 2016).

According to Public Health Scotland, over 13% of children are from low-income families, and nearly 9% of the population are income deprived. Both statistics are below Scotland's average. This is compared with Torry East, where over 25% of children are from low-income families and 21% of the population are income deprived (Public Health Scotland, Health, and Wellbeing Profile Aberdeen City).

Critical success factors

There are several critical success criteria that align with Aberdeen's South Locality Community Plan which prioritises the neighbourhoods of Torry and Kincorth.

Critical success criteria
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities.</p>
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information.</p>

1.1.1.1 Assumptions and Qualifications Assumptions

When understanding whether an option meets objectives, we have reviewed each option against the critical success factors, vision and priorities set out in the South Locality Community Plan. When understanding impact, we have also included impacts on safety and security, psychosocial (health and wellbeing) crime, air, and noise quality.

When writing the appraisal, we take into consideration stakeholders who have been identified by the Council, including residents living in, or who have lived in RAAC affected homes, the local community (those that live within a 30m radius of RAAC affected homes), the wider community (Torry) and council tenants across Aberdeen.

Qualifications

We have taken into consideration research undertaken by UNDP Sustainability Goals and World Health Organisation Housing and Health Guidelines. In addition, we have reviewed and refer to Aberdeen's Community Planning Team and Supplementary Wellbeing Guidance set out by The Green Book. We have also taken into consideration both qualitative and quantitative responses from key stakeholders who filled out the surveys on options and equality.

Weighting criteria

Options are weighted amongst the following criteria

Meeting objectives	Level of <i>negative</i> impact	Weighting
Fully Meets Objectives	No Impact	100%
Mostly Meets Objectives	Minimal Impact	66%
Partially Meets Objectives	Moderate Impact	33%
Does Not Meet Objectives	Significant impact	0%
Negatively Impacts Objectives	Major impact	-33%
Very negative impact on objectives	Transformation impact	-66%

Level of negative Impact explained

Impact scales	Description
Minimal Impact	Limited impact on households and wider communities, including crime, safety and psychosocial.
Moderate Impact	Noticeable impact for households and wider communities, including crime, safety and psychosocial.
Significant impact	Broad impact for households and wider communities, including crime, safety and psychosocial.
Major impact	Substantial impact for households and wider communities, including crime, safety and psychosocial.
Transformation impact	Major impact for households and wider communities, including crime, safety and psychosocial.

Do Nothing Option: No further action is taken

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	-66%	-66%	40%	<p>Residents would not be permitted move into the homes affected by RAAC. This may affect the local and wider community in regard to sense of loss and potential loneliness.</p> <p>Due to RAAC remaining in situ if the 'do nothing' option were to be taken, negative impact on health and wellbeing of resident homeowners remaining in RAAC affected homes due to impact of RAAC defects including water ingress remain prevalent.</p>
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	-66%	-66%	30%	<p>Council tenants will continue to move out of the homes and area, resulting in RAAC affected homes being empty for long periods of time, leading to potential increase in crime and anti-social behaviour. In addition, homes will not be made available to council tenants.</p>
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	-66%	-66%	20%	<p>There will be no further additional employment opportunities, nor opportunities for enterprises.</p>
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	-33%	-33%	10%	<p>There will be no opportunities for installation of smart technologies.</p>

Option 2: Install a support timber frame under existing RAAC roof panels

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	-33%	-33%	40%	<p>No significant improvement to be made to the community regarding health and wellbeing if option were to be taken.</p> <p>Due to RAAC remaining in situ if option were to be taken, negative impact on health and wellbeing of residents living in RAAC affected homes due to further disturbance towards residents and impact on RAAC defects because water ingress remains prevalent.</p> <p>Survey results show key stakeholders see this option as having a negative impact on health and wellbeing of residents having to live in the homes.</p>
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	-33%	-33%	30%	<p>Due to RAAC remaining in situ if this option was taken, works will not be seen to provide well maintained housing that can be sustained. This is due to works being a temporary solution.</p> <p>In addition, survey responses show that key stakeholders will not feel safe in the homes if they had to move back into homes or begin a new tenancy where RAAC remains.</p>
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	-33%	-33%	20%	<p>There will be a number of employment opportunities, however due to the works required, employment opportunities will provide little opportunity for enterprises.</p>
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	-33%	-33%	10%	<p>There will be no opportunities for installation of smart technologies.</p>

Option 3a: Removal of RAAC panels and replace roof

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	-33%	-33%	40%	Due to the current conditions of homes considered to be of lower quality, this option will not improve the health and wellbeing of key stakeholders. Some residents living in RAAC affected homes may continue to have major repair issues around damp and mould if other upgrades are not carried out at the same time.
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	-33%	-33%	30%	Due to the current conditions of homes being of lower quality this option will not provide well maintained housing. There is also a risk of increasing damage due to homes being exposed to elements whilst works take place.
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	0%	0%	20%	There will be several employment opportunities, however due to the works required, there will be few enterprise opportunities.
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	-33%	-33%	10%	There will be no opportunities for installation of smart technologies.

Option 3b: Removal of RAAC panels and replace roof and EESSH2 Works

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	33%	33%	40%	<p>By retrofitting homes, residents living in RAAC affected homes may attain improved health conditions as the retrofit would address poor ventilation and insulation.</p> <p>However, due to cost of works, this option may undermine sense of security and stability for homeowners.</p>
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	66%	33%	30%	<p>By retrofitting homes, residents will live in well maintained and sustainable housing.</p> <p>Due to the extent of works, there may be increased levels of noise and air pollution during works.</p>
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	33%	33%	20%	<p>Due to the type of employment opportunities made available to support the retrofitting of homes, there will be opportunities for both employment and enterprise opportunities.</p>
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	33%	33%	10%	<p>When retrofitting homes, residents are able to have access to smart readers and other technologies that supports energy readings and therefore helps with effective energy management.</p>

Option 4a: Demolition only

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	-66%	-66%	40%	Due to the level of impact demolition is perceived to have on the community, this option is seen to have a very negative impact on the health and wellbeing of the community.
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	-66%	-66%	30%	Due to this option resulting in a loss of homes, and potential increase in crime and anti-social behaviour, this is seen to have a very negative impact on the community.
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	-33%	-33%	20%	This option will provide a limited number of employment opportunities, and due to the work required, there will not be enterprise opportunities.
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	-66%	-66%	10%	There will be no opportunities for installation of smart technologies.

Option 4b: Demolition and build new homes

Priorities	Meeting Objectives	Level of Negative Impact	Weighting	Description
<p>Our People</p> <p>We will improve our health and wellbeing and protect our community from harm.</p>	33%	33%	40%	Due to the provision of new homes that meet modern standards, the health and wellbeing of residents will improve.
<p>Our Place</p> <p>We have access to affordable, fit for purpose well maintained housing which we can sustain.</p>	66%	66%	30%	Due to the provision of new homes that will be made affordable and be compliant to modern building standards, this option will provide access to affordable homes that are fit for purpose and well maintained.
<p>Our Economy</p> <p>Access to employment and enterprise opportunities</p>	66%	66%	20%	There will be a satisfactory number of employment and enterprise opportunities made available as part of the masterplan.
<p>Our technology</p> <p>Improve digital access to community information</p>	33%	33%	10%	Homes will provide residents with access to smart readers and other technologies that supports energy readings and therefore helps with effective energy management.